



**Department of Engineering
and Public Works**

P.O. Box 21229

West Palm Beach, FL 33416-1229

(561) 684-4000

FAX: (561) 684-4050

www.pbcgov.com



**Palm Beach County
Board of County
Commissioners**

Maria Sachs, Mayor

Maria G. Marino, Vice Mayor

Gregg K. Weiss

Michael A. Barnett

Marci Woodward

Sara Baxter

Mack Bernard

County Administrator

Verdenia C. Baker

*"An Equal Opportunity
Affirmative Action Employer"*

June 25, 2024

To: Kittelson & Associates, Inc.

**Subj: June 25, 2024, Selection Committee Results
Award Recommendation
Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan
Federally Funded
Project No.: 2023722**

Dear Consultants:

This letter serves to advise you of the results of the June 25, 2024, Selection Committee for the above referenced project. The firm that has been selected is: **Kittelson & Associates, Inc.**

Consultants are hereby notified of the "Cone of Silence" requirements pursuant to Palm Beach County Lobbyist Registration Ordinance 2003-055.

In accordance with Palm Beach County PPM #CW-O-048, the results of the Selection Committee meeting shall be reported in writing to the Board of County Commissioners (Board). If any member of the Board has not requested to review the ranking of the Selection Committee Meeting within ten (10) business days of such report, it shall be deemed that the Board has affirmed the selection. The selected firm will be contacted to schedule a scope of services meeting and begin negotiations.

The enclosed Award Recommendation will be posted at the Engineering & Public Works Department / Roadway Production Reception area on the 3rd Floor at 2300 North Jog Road, West Palm Beach, Florida on July 1, 2024. If your office wishes to protest the award recommendation, you may do so by addressing your protest to Ms. Melody Thelwell, Director, Palm Beach County Purchasing Department, 50 South Military Trail, West Palm Beach, Florida 33415. Failure to submit a protest to the Director of Purchasing within five (5) business days after posting of the Award Recommendation,



June 25, 2024, Selection Committee Results
Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan
Federally Funded
Project No.: 2023722
June 25, 2024

as prescribed in Section 2-55(b) of the Palm Beach County Code, shall constitute a waiver of proceedings under the referenced County Code.

Thank you for your time in presenting your approach for this project. We encourage you to submit on future projects. Should you have any questions or require additional information please contact me at 561-684-4122 or at hknight@pbcgov.org.

Sincerely,



Holly B. Knight, P.E.
Contracts Section Manager

Attachments:

1. Compilation of Votes
2. Tally Summary Sheets
3. Selection Committee Meeting Minutes
4. Selection Committee Voting Ballots
5. Summary of Teams
6. Sign-in Sheet

cc: with Attachments

Patrick Rutter, Assistant County Administrator
David L. Ricks, P.E., County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Joanne M. Keller, P.E., Deputy County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Steven B. Carrier, P.E. Assistant County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Morton L. Rose, P.E., Director, Roadway Production, Engineering & Public Works
Kathleen O. Farrell, P.E., Asst. Director, Roadway Prod. Div., Eng. & Public Works
Holly B. Knight, P.E., Contracts Mgr, Roadway Prod. Div., Eng. & Public Works
Motasem Al-Turk, P.E., Director, Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works
Fadi Emil Nassar, P.E., Traffic Operations Mgr., Traffic Div., Eng. & Public Works
Melissa Ackert, P.E., Asst. Director, Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works
JaeAnn Dean, Technical Assistant II, Roadway Prod. Div., Eng. & Public Works
Danny Ramlalsingh, Fiscal Manager, Administrative Services Division
Yicel Corcino, Financial Analyst II, Administrative Services Division
Ali Bayat, P.E., Director, Water Utilities Department
Henry Melendez, P.E., CIP Project Manager, Water Utilities Department



June 25, 2024, Selection Committee Results
Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan
Federally Funded
Project No.: 2023722
June 25, 2024

Brenda Znachko, Director, Contract Development and Control
Fanny Amini, Contract Analyst, Contract Development and Control
Tonya Johnson, Director, Office of Equal Business Opportunity (OEBO)
Allen Gray, Small Business Development Mgr, OEBO
Angela Smith, Small Business Development Specialist, OEBO
Melody Thelwell, Director, Purchasing Department
File

COMPILATION OF SELECTION COMMITTEE VOTING BALLOTS

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: All Engineering Services Required for:

Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan

Federally Funded

PROJECT NO: 2023722

MEETING DATE: Tuesday, June 25, 2024

MEETING TIME: 9:00 A.M.

<i>TOTALS / RANKINGS</i>		
Total points from each voting member and associated rank of firm.		
Selection Committee	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	
David Ricks	74	1
Absent		
Henry Melendez	72	1
Fanny Amini	76	1
Motasem Al-Turk	76	1
Angela Smith	76	1
Fadi Emil Nassar	72	1
TOTAL		6
RANK		1

JaeAnn Dean

Secretary Name Printed



Secretary Signature

CRITERIA:

Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.

MAX SCORE 35

Selection Committee	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.
David Ricks	34
Henry Melendez	33
Fanny Amini	35
Motasem Al-Turk	35
Angela Smith	35
Fadi Emil Nassar	32

CRITERIA:

Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.

MAX SCORE 35

Selection Committee	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.
David Ricks	34
Henry Melendez	33
Fanny Amini	35
Motasem Al-Turk	35
Angela Smith	35
Fadi Emil Nassar	34

CRITERIA:

Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)

MAX SCORE 10

Selection Committee	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.
David Ricks	6
Henry Melendez	6
Fanny Amini	6
Motasem Al-Turk	6
Angela Smith	6
Fadi Emil Nassar	6

FINAL SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan Federally Funded Project No. 2023722

June 25, 2024

Called to Order: 9:07 A.M.

Adjourned: 10:01 A.M.

Engineering & Public Works, 2300 N. Jog Road, 3rd Floor Conference Room 3W-12

MEMBERS PRESENT:

David L. Ricks, P.E.	- County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Henry Melendez, P.E.*	- CIP Project Manager, Water Utilities Department
Fanny Amini**	- Contract Analyst, Contract Development & Control, OFMB
Motasem Al-Turk, P.E.	- Director, Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works
Angela Smith***	- Small Business Development Specialist III, Office of Equal Business Opportunity
Fadi Emil Nassar, P.E.	- Traffic Operations Manager, Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works

denote any delegated votes here:

*Ali Bayat, P.E.	- Director, Water Utilities Department
**Brenda Znachko	- Director, Contract Development & Control, OFMB
***Tonya Johnson	- Director, Office of Equal Business Opportunity

DISCUSSION:

Quorum was present and represented by a minimum of four members at least two of which are engineers.

The Final Selection Committee was called to order by David Ricks, P.E., County Engineer. It was stated that the committee would be selecting a firm for professional engineering consulting services for the Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan – Federally Funded.

The meeting was opened up the meeting for public comments, public was present but none had questions or comments.

Opening discussion identifying and outlining the project requirements was given by Motasem Al-Turk, P.E., Traffic Division Director and Fadi Emil Nassar, P.E., Traffic Operations Manager, Traffic Division. The outline stated what the work entailed, and what the committee should be looking for in the presentations by the firms.

The order of business was to select one consultant.

Final Selection Committee Meeting Minutes (cont.)
Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan – Federally Funded
June 25, 2024

Each consultant made a presentation of their qualifications before the Final Selection Committee and answered questions from committee members.

At the end of the presentations David Ricks, P.E., County Engineer stated that the public is welcome to make comments or sit and observe the discussions. Kittelson & Associates, Inc. team were present.

Committee discussed the presentation and the project and then voted.

RESULTS:

The Final Selection Committee voting resulted in the following ranking order of the consultants:

1. **Kittelson & Associates, Inc.** (*Selected Consultant*)

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for: Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan - Federally Funded		
PROJECT NO:	2023722		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Tuesday, June 25, 2024		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	9:00 A.M.		

Criteria	Max Score	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.
<p>Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Professional qualifications of proposed project team to perform subject work; Demonstrated knowledge of criteria for similar projects; Demonstrated past performance of the firm and project team in completing similar projects.</p>	35	34
<p>Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of the presentation/written response, including meeting time requirements.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Demonstrated understanding of the project and County's goals and objectives; Demonstrated innovation in project approach; Demonstrated ideas for cost-effectiveness; Quality and clarity of presentation/written response to the public announcement; Demonstrated ability to meet schedule requirements.</p>	35	34
<i>Subtotal</i>	70	68
<p>Volume of previous work awarded or funded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score)</p>	10	6
<i>Subtotal</i>	10	6
Total	80	74
<i>Rank</i>		1

Member's Name: DAVID L RICKS

Member's Signature: *David L Ricks*



SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:		All Engineering Services Required for: Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan - Federally Funded		
PROJECT NO:		2023722		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:		Tuesday, June 25, 2024		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:		9:00 A.M.		
Criteria	Max Score	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.		
<p>Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Professional qualifications of proposed project team to perform subject work; Demonstrated knowledge of criteria for similar projects; Demonstrated past performance of the firm and project team in completing similar projects.</p>	35	33		
<p>Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of the presentation/written response, including meeting time requirements.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Demonstrated understanding of the project and County's goals and objectives; Demonstrated innovation in project approach; Demonstrated ideas for cost-effectiveness; Quality and clarity of presentation/written response to the public announcement; Demonstrated ability to meet schedule requirements.</p>	35	33		
<i>Subtotal</i>	70	66		
<p>Volume of previous work awarded or funded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score)</p>	10	6		
<i>Subtotal</i>	10	6		
Total		80	78	
		Rank	1	
Member's Name: Henry Melendez				
Member's Signature: [Signature] 6/25/24				

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for: Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan - Federally Funded			
PROJECT NO:	2023722			
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Tuesday, June 25, 2024			
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	9:00 A.M.			
Criteria	Max Score	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.		
<p>Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation:</p> <p>Professional qualifications of proposed project team to perform subject work; Demonstrated knowledge of criteria for similar projects; Demonstrated past performance of the firm and project team in completing similar projects.</p>	35	35		
<p>Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of the presentation/written response, including meeting time requirements.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation:</p> <p>Demonstrated understanding of the project and County's goals and objectives; Demonstrated innovation in project approach; Demonstrated ideas for cost-effectiveness; Quality and clarity of presentation/written response to the public announcement; Demonstrated ability to meet schedule requirements.</p>	35	35		
<i>Subtotal</i>	70	70		
<p>Volume of previous work awarded or funded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score)</p>	10	6		
<i>Subtotal</i>	10	6		
Total		80	76	
		<i>Rank</i>	1	
Member's Name: <i>Fanny M. Amici Brenda Frachko</i>				
Member's Signature: <i>Fanny M. Amici</i>				



SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for: Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan - Federally Funded		
PROJECT NO:	2023722		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Tuesday, June 25, 2024		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	9:00 A.M.		



Criteria	Max Score	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.		
<p>Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Professional qualifications of proposed project team to perform subject work; Demonstrated knowledge of criteria for similar projects; Demonstrated past performance of the firm and project team in completing similar projects.</p>	35	35		
<p>Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of the presentation/written response, including meeting time requirements.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Demonstrated understanding of the project and County's goals and objectives; Demonstrated innovation in project approach; Demonstrated ideas for cost-effectiveness; Quality and clarity of presentation/written response to the public announcement; Demonstrated ability to meet schedule requirements.</p>	35	35		
<i>Subtotal</i>	70			
<p>Volume of previous work awarded or funded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score)</p>	10	6		
<i>Subtotal</i>	10	06		
Total	80	76		
	<i>Rank</i>	1		

Member's Name: Motaseem Al-Turk

Member's Signature:

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for: Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan - Federally Funded		
PROJECT NO:	2023722		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Tuesday, June 25, 2024		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	9:00 A.M.		

Criteria	Max Score	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.		
<p>Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation:</p> <p>Professional qualifications of proposed project team to perform subject work; Demonstrated knowledge of criteria for similar projects; Demonstrated past performance of the firm and project team in completing similar projects.</p>	35	35		
<p>Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of the presentation/written response, including meeting time requirements.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation:</p> <p>Demonstrated understanding of the project and County's goals and objectives; Demonstrated innovation in project approach; Demonstrated ideas for cost-effectiveness; Quality and clarity of presentation/written response to the public announcement; Demonstrated ability to meet schedule requirements.</p>	35	35		
<i>Subtotal</i>	70	70		
<p>Volume of previous work awarded or funded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score)</p>	10	6		
<i>Subtotal</i>	10	0		
Total	80	76		
	<i>Rank</i>	1		

Member's Name:	Angela Smith
Member's Signature:	

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM



ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for: Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan - Federally Funded		
PROJECT NO:	2023722		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Tuesday, June 25, 2024		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	9:00 A.M.		

Criteria	Max Score	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.		
<p>Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Professional qualifications of proposed project team to perform subject work; Demonstrated knowledge of criteria for similar projects; Demonstrated past performance of the firm and project team in completing similar projects.</p>	35	32		
<p>Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of the presentation/written response, including meeting time requirements.</p> <p>Areas of Consideration in the Evaluation: Demonstrated understanding of the project and County's goals and objectives; Demonstrated innovation in project approach; Demonstrated ideas for cost-effectiveness; Quality and clarity of presentation/written response to the public announcement; Demonstrated ability to meet schedule requirements.</p>	35	34		
<i>Subtotal</i>	70	66		
<p>Volume of previous work awarded or funded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score)</p>	10	6		
<i>Subtotal</i>	10	0		
Total	80	72		
	Rank	1		

Member's Name: FADI NASSAR

Member's Signature:

SELECTION CONSULTANT SUMMARY

One (1) Firm to Provide:	Professional Engineering Consulting Services for Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan Federally Funded
Project No:	2023722
EBO API's:	N/A
Meeting Date:	Tuesday, June 25, 2024
Meeting Time:	9:00 A.M.

<u>TEAM</u>				<u>LOCATION</u>		<u>EBO</u>				<u>VOLUME OF PREVIOUS WORK</u>			
Team Members	Services Provided (PBC CCNA Categories)	% Work on Project	Notes	% Work in PBC	Points (3 max)	SBE	PBC M/WBE	FL M/WBE	Points (17 max)	Fee Considered	Pro-Rated Fee *	Points (10 max)	
Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	3.05 & 3.06	50%	8	0%	N/A			50.0	N/A	\$6,004	\$3,002	6	
INRIX, Inc.	Software Licensing	13%	2, 8								\$0		\$0
Kimley-Horn & Associates, Inc.	3.05 & 3.06	31%	10	15.5%				31.0			\$1,795,642		\$556,649
Quality Counts, LLC	Data Collection	0%	2, 8								\$0		\$0
The Brand Advocates, Inc.	Public Engagement	4%	2								\$0		\$0
The Haskell Company	Public Engagement	2%	2								\$0		\$0
		100%		15.5%		0.0%	0.0%	81.0%		\$559,651			

<u>Prime Categories</u>	<u>Subcategories</u>	<u>Notes</u>
3.05 (Traffic Operations Studies)	3.06 (Traffic Operations Design)	* - Pro Rated Fee = Previous Work Amount multiplied by the % of work on the project 1 - Prime and Sub on different teams 2 - Unrequested Service 3 - Incomplete Team 4 - Did not meet mandatory EBO requirement 5 - Prime is doing less than 50% of the work 6 - Prime does not have at least one prime category 7 - Errors or Blanks on Questionnaires or Forms Missing 8 - Not registered in VSS 9 - SF 330 Missing or Incomplete 10 - Errors on Summary Chart at End of Letter (i.e. blanks, TBD instead of value, incorrect company name) 11 - Not CCNA Certified in a category they propose to provide 12 - Firm has provided a disclosure of a conflict

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Palm Beach County Engineering Department

One (1) Firm - to provide all engineering services required for the preparation of plans and specifications complete for formal advertising and receipt of bids for:

**Palm Beach County Safety Action Plan
Federally Funded
Project No. 2023722**

June 25, 2024

Name	Organization	Phone	Email
JaeAnn Deem	PBC Eng./CCNA	561/684-4154	jadean@pbc.gov
Fanny M. Amici	OFMB/CDC	561-355-3352	FAmici@pbc.gov
Holly Knight	PBC	561.684.4150	hknight@pbc.gov
DAVID RICKS	COUNTY ENG	--	DRICKS@PBC.GOV
Angela Smith	OESD	Tel-616-6840	asmith1@pbc.gov
Henry Melendez	WWD/Eng	(561) 493-6120	hmelendez@pbcwater.com
Melissa Acker	PBC EPW	561 684 4101	MAcker@pbc.gov
Fadi Nassar	PBC EPW	"	fnassar@pbc.gov
Mo Al-Turk	PBC Traf.	561-684-4030	malturk@pbc.gov